

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

Pursuant to Statute
By Command
In Journ to Order

Clerk of the Senate. 22 AUG 1923

REPORT

PROM THE

JOINT COMMITTEE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS

CEO1

WAR SERVICE HOMES DISPOSALS.

Presented by Command; ordered to be printed

, 19**33.**.

Goot of Paper. Proparation not given : copies : approximate cost of printing and publishing & .

Printed and Published for the GOVERNMENT of the COMMONWEAUTH of AUSTRALIA by ALBRET J. MULLSPT,
GOVERNMENT Printer for the State of Victoria.

No. __E 6888__Prover Sci.

MEMBERS OF THE COMMONWEALTH PARLIAMENTARY JOINT COMMITTEE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS.

(Fourth Committee.)

JAMES GARFIELD BAYLEY, Esquire, M.P., Chairman.

JAMES EDWARD FENTON, Esquire, M.P., Vice-Chairman.

Senate.

* Senator Benjamin Benny.

· Appointed 5th July, 1928.

- † Senator Lieut-Col. WILLIAM KINSEY BOLTON, C.B.E.,
- † Senator Richard Buzacott.

 * Senator Harold Edward Elliott, C.B., C.M.G.;
- D.S.O., D.C.M.

 Senator John Dunlop Millen.

* Senator Edward Needham.

House of Representatives

JAMES AITCHIESON JOHNSTON HUNTER, Esquire, M.P.
NORMAN JOHN OSWALD MAKIN, Esquire, M.P.
WALTER MOFFITT MARKS, Esquire, M.P.

THOMAS PATERSON, Esquire, M.P.

JOHN EDWARD WEST, Esquire, M.P.

. \$ Besigned 28th June, 1928.

JOINT COMMITTEE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS.

REPORT

ON THE

WAR SERVICE HOMES DISPOSALS.

INTRODUCTORY.

In the Final Report upon the War Service Homes Commission, which the Third Joint Committee of Public Accounts presented to Parliament on 27th July, 1922 (Parliamentary Paper No. 32 of Session 1922), reference was made to the losses which it was anticipated would follow the change of policy, announced in July, 1921, in connexion with the War Service Homes scheme whereby all constructional work by day labour was to cease, and limited building operations were to be carried out under the contract system or handed over to such State organizations as would undertake the erection of the houses.

In view of the inevitable extensive loss of public money involved, the Joint Committee of Public Accounts deemed it essential to continue the investigation of the previous Committee and go further into this phase of the activities of the War Service Homes Commission in order to acquaint Parliament with the present position.

The taking of evidence on this inquiry was commenced on the 2nd May last and concluded on the 9th August—portion of the work having been carried on by the Committee concurrently with another investigation.

During the investigation the following witnesses were examined:-

Allard, Alfred Gordon, of Baillieu, Allard Pty. Ltd., Auctioneers, Collins House, Melbourne.

Chitty, Charley, Timber Merchant, Dandenong-road, East Malvern.

Evans, Harrie Smallie, resident partner, Messrs. David Fell and Co., Public Accountants, 314 Collins-street, Melbourne; formerly Consulting Accountant to the War Service Homes Commission.

Hill, Thomas, Chief Engineer, Works and Railways Department, Melbourne. Loynes, James, Deputy Commissioner for War Service Homes, Queensland. Mann, Harry Akhurst, supplies officer, War Service Homes Commission.

Morrell, James Charles, Deputy Commissioner for War Service Homes, New South Wales.

Percival, Arthur, Assistant Commonwealth Surveyor-General, Melbourne.

Peterson, Charles Wentworth, Secretary, War Service Homes Commission.
Semmens, Colonel James Michael, O.B.E., V.D., Acting War Service Homes
Commissioner.

Smith, Edward, formerly Deputy Commissioner for War Service Homes, Western Australia and Victoria.

Smith, Ralph Gordon, Accountant, War Service Homes Commission, Queensland.

The Committee also availed itself of some of the evidence on this subject heard by the previous Committee.

EXPLANATORY.

To carry out the work of providing homes for returned soldiers and their dependants in accordance with his original programme, the War Service Homes Commissioner acquired large areas of building land in the various States and extensive timber areas and saw-mills in Queensland and Victoria; he purchased great quantities of building material of all kinds, and entered into long-dated contracts for heavy supplies of timber, joinery, cement, tiles, and other goods necessary for his purpose. Store depôts were established throughout the States, and, in addition to setting up manufacturing concerns of his own, the Commissioner financed private firms to extend their works and plant to meet his anticipated demands.

With the change of policy came the necessity for disposing of the various assets and stocks on hand, which were being added to daily by deliveries under running contracts. To deal with the position, the then Assistant Minister (Mr. Rodgers) decided to set up an organization for the disposal of surplus stores, etc., which would take over all stocks and be practically independent of the Commissioner and his deputies. About October 1921, he appointed a Central Disposals Board comprising Major-General Sir J. W. McCay as Chairman, and Mr. T. Hill, Chief Engineer of the Commonwealth Works and Railways Department, as second member. In New South Wales, Queensland, Western Australia, and Tasmania, subsidiary Boards were appointed to supervise and conduct the sales, whilst in Victoria this work was performed by the Central Board in addition to its other responsibilities. No Board was appointed in South Australia, as there were no materials to be disposed of in that State. In selecting the personnel for the subsidiary Boards an endeavour was made to secure the services of well-known business men to act in conjunction with responsible local officials. These Boards were originally constituted as follows:—

New South Wales-Mr. G. J. Oakeshott, Commonwealth Works Director for New South Wales, and Mr. John Harrison.

Queensland—Mr. E. E. Smith, Commonwealth Works Director for Queensland, and Mr. A. S. Midson.

Western Australia.—Mr W. B. Hardwick, Principal Architect, State Public Works Department, and Mr. Leslie.

Tasmania.—Mr. H. Bucirde, of the State Public Works Department, and Mr. W. Taylor, Deputy Commissioner for War Service Homes.

Owing to the comparatively small stocks in Tasmania, the local Deputy Commissioner acted on behalf of the Commission.

Major-General McCay performed his duties as Chairman of the Disposals Board concurrently with those of Business Adviser, to which position he had been appointed a few months previously on the termination of the work of the Advisory and Consultative Committee. As Business Adviser he investigated the current contracts of the Commission and made recommendations to the Minister concerning them

The general scheme provided for the State Boards to dispose of the stocks on hand at prices approved by the Central Board. The Board recognized that it would be operating on a falling market; it had to take into account the fact that the longer stocks were held the more they would diminish in value, and whilst expediting the work it endeavoured to avoid anything in the nature of forced realization. Its policy was to refrain as far as possible from disturbing the market, and by offering slight reductions for cash, and quoting wholesale or retail rates according to the quantity desired, to make prompt cash sales wherever possible.

The operations of the Disposals Boards commenced about October, 1921, and ceased on 30th June, 1922. Since that date the Acting Commissioner for War Service Homes, with Mr. Hill assisting in an advisory capacity, has been endeavouring through the Deputy Commissioners to sell the balance of stocks taken back from the Disposal Boards.

ASSETS FOR DISPOSAL.

The assets of the Commission, which on account of the change of policy, became available for disposal, comprised:—

(a) Timber Areas and Saw-mills in Queensland :

(b) Building Materials:

(c) Depôts and Plant.

(a) TIMBER AREAS AND SAWMILLS IN QUEENSLAND.

The question of the purchase by the Commissioner of timber areas, saw-mills, and joinery works in Queensland was investigated by the Third Joint Committee of Public Accounts, which presented a report thereon to Parliament on 26th November, 1920 (Parliamentary Paper No. 82 of 1920).

The properties originally acquired comprised-

(1) From Lahevs Limited-

- (a) at Canungra—10,412 acres of freehold land, of which 4,392 acres carry pine, and up-to-date saw and planing mill situated on about 17 acres of leasehold land adjoining the railway, together with all working plant, railway and branch lines—totalling 16 miles, locomotives, rolling stock, bush plant, &c.
- (b) at Beaudesert—a newly erected saw-mill, situated on a block of 62 acres of freehold land, served by a railway siding.

(c) at South Brisbane-Joinery Works and Offices.

The price agreed upon was £243,600, half in cash and half in Peace Bonds. It was stipulated that, at the end of varying periods, Lahey Ltd. should have the right to re-purchase the freehold land for the sum of £5,570.

(2) From Mr. J. F. Brett-

- (a) at Beaudesert-1,786 acres of freehold and 2,270 acres of timber rights.
- (b) at Blackbutt-1,688 acres of freehold and 3,527 acres of timber rights.
- (c) at Killarney-4,601 acres of freehold and 424 acres of timber rights -- with . ' two saw-mills.
- (d) at Samford-2,196 acres of freehold and 841 acres of timber rights.

The price paid was £220,000, half in cash and half in Peace Bonds. In addition the vendor was given the right to the "tops," on all the properties acquired from himself and Lahevs Ltd.

In view of the policy at that time in regard to the erection of War Service Homes, the Committee found that the acquisition of the properties was necessary to insure the carrying out of the undertaking of the Commissioner, and that at the time the terms upon which these had been secured were, on the whole, satisfactory. Recognising that considerable friction must result in having two divergent interests operating simultaneously, not only on the same area but upon the same tree, the Committee recommended that the decision concerning the "tops" should be reconsidered. The "tops" were subsequently re-purchased by the Commission from Mr. Brett for the sum of £20,000.

Owing to the change in the policy, however, practically the whole of these Queensland properties have been standing idle since the time of purchase. The joinery works, after being leased for some months, were sold at the price paid for them. Tenders were called early in 1921 for the working of the timber properties, but none was accepted. One of the Killarney Mills has been leased. A few of the timber areas have been sold, and some with short-dated leases have been let on royalties, whilst one area has lapsed on account of the Commission's failure to exercise its option of renewal. Two offers were made by Laheys Ltd. to take back the properties sold by them to the Commonwealth, but neither was considered satisfactory.

The latest action taken concerning the Queensland properties has been to call tenders for the sale of the saw mills at Canungra, Beaudesert, Emu Vale, and Killarney, the surrounding freehold land, and the standing timber thereon. The offers received are at present under consideration.

(b) Building Material.

Upon the appointment of the Disposal Boards all stocks of building material were taken over from the Deputy Commissioners. Although instructions were issued that stock was to be taken by a representative of the Board and of the Commission, book values were subsequently adopted in order to secure continuity. It was considered, too, that the expense of taking stock of the enormous quantities of timber in Queensland and Victoria would be unwarranted.

To utilize some of the material, steps were taken to include in specifications for such houses as were being erected certain lines which were in stock, but as most contractors preferred to deal with their regular suppliers, the result was negligible.

Much difficulty was experienced in disposing of many of the lines, not only on account of the enormous quantities, but also by reason of the departure from the regular designs and trade sizes. This referred particularly to the stocks of joinery in the Eastern States, and to the hardwood, weatherboards, and glass in Victoria. In Western Australia, excessive quantities of hardware and electrical fittings were purchased. In an endeavour to effect a clearance of these lines the principal hardware merchants in Perth were approached by the local Disposals Board, and eventually a combination of six of these firms bought up practically the whole of the remaining stocks of the Commission at prices which represented a considerable loss to the Commonwealth. In reporting the sale to the Central Board, the Chairman of the Western Australian Board intimated that his Board had accepted as correct the statement of the merchants that "the quantities now purchased are so large that, even spread over the various firms, they represent several years' stock, and consequently the risk of buying with the present unsettled state of the market is very great." Further information concerning the transaction being desired by the Central Board, it was explained that "the prospects of obtaining anything like satisfaction on the basis of retailing these stocks in the city were bad, and although the loss sustained is of some consequence, we (the Disposals Board) are finnly of opinion that the best thing has been done to quit the lot.

It is of very little satisfaction, although advisable, to have taken the course adopted."

The following statements compiled as at 30th June, 1923, shows the value of the various lines of material taken over by the Boards in each State, the proceeds from the sales, the loss on

	NEW SOUTH	WALES.		
	Book value of Majerials taken over.	Proceeds from sales.	Loss on sales,	Book value of Materials on hand
	£	£	£	£
Timber	90,547	63,654	26,893	.2.
Joinery	28,362	17,057	10,046	1,259
Hardware	99,095	51,396	47,699	
Iron	11,600	8,495	3,105	
Cement, Bricks, Tiles, &c	11,889	8,988	2,891	10
	241,493	149,590	90,634	1,269
	VICTOR	RIA.		
	Book value of: Materials taken over.	Proceeds from sales.	Loss on sales.	Book value of Materials on hand
	£	£	£	£
Timber	257,466	146,917	(Not yet ascertainable)	Not yet ascertainable
Joinery	16,962	12,290 •	,,	,,
Hardware	31,325	17,025	,,,,,	,,
Iron	6,000	6,051	749	
Glass	16,205 11,544	6,399 6,159	. 9,806 5,385	
Piping Paints, Oils, Stains, &c.	8,475	4,355	(Not yet	(Not yet
raints, Olis, Stains, &c.		, ,,,,,,	ascertainable)	ascertainable
Cement, Bricks, Tiles, &c.	3,785	2,367	1,418	
Sundries	7,041	3,222	(Not yet ascertainable)	(Not yet ascertainable
	359,603	204,785	92,874	61,944
	QUEENSL	AND.		
	Book value of Materials taken over.	Proceeds from sales.	Loss on salos.	Book value of Materials on hand
		· _		-
m: 1	£	£ 500	. £	L (Not yet
limber	329,751	257,520	(Not yet ascertainable)	ascertainable
oinery	11,548	5,822	,,,	,,
Iardware	15,768	8,192	, ,, .	,,,
ron and Plumbers' Ware	25,208	11,210	"	,,
Paints, Oils, &c	9,218	3,152	",	"
	391,493	285,896	30,056	75,541 .
	WESTERN AU	STRALIA.		
- -	Book value of Materials taken over.	Proceeds from sales	Loss on sales	Book value of Materials on hand
	£	£	£	£
limber	20.000	14,110	8,811	15,175
onery	7,170	2,686	1,613	2,871
Iardware	26,058	13,670	11,934	454
liscellaneous Stores returned from C	on-	000	B 000	
struction Works	4,130	830	3,300	

31,296

25,658

~ TASMANIA.

	·			Book value of Materials taken over.	Proceeds from sales.	Low on tales.	Book value of Materials on hand.	
					£	£	£	£
Pimber .					3,100	2,252	848	• • •
Joinery					1,303	1,058	245	
Hardware					3,316	2,196	1,067	53
[ron				r- ·	2,291	1,625	666	
Piping					1,341	558	783	
Paints and					533	- 294	119	120
Cement, Br				,.	543	453	46	44
Sundries	••				203	163	15	25
					12,630	8,599	3,789	242

In cases where the losses and quantities on hand are shown as "not yet ascertainable" the Commission is not in a position to supply details of the items, but the aggregate loss for each State has been ascertained by deducting from the total value of material taken over the amount received from sales and the value of stocks on hand. To that extent, therefore, the losses indicated

The position regarding materials, as at 30th June, 1923, may be summarized as under :-

· 	New South Wales.	Victoria.	Quecusland.	Weatern- Australia.	Tasmania.	Commonwealth,
Value taken on charge by Board Sales	£ 241,493 149,590	£ 359,603 204,785	£ 391,493 285,896	£ 75,454 31,296	£ 12,630 8,599	£ 1,080,673 680,166
Value of Materials remaining	91,903 1,269	154,818 61,944	105,597 75,541	44,158 18,500	4,031 242	400,507 157,496
Loss on Sales of Materials Amount written off Materials for depreciation at 30th June, 1921	90,634 15,243	92,874 79,849	30,056 2,708	25,658 397	3,789 1,969	243,011 100,166
Aggregate Loss on Materials only	105,877	172,723	32,764	26,055	5,758	343,177

(c) DEPÔTS AND PLANT.

To conduct the day-labour operations of the Commission, depôts were established at various centres in the different States.

In New South Wales there were three depôts around Sydney, viz., Auburn, Belmore, and Chatswood; one at Newcastle, and another at Goulburn. Land was also acquired at Alexandria, near Sydney, at a cost of £5,000, for the purpose of opening a sand pit. The original intention was to cart the sand to the station, 1½ miles distant, and distribute it by rail to the various centres. It was found later that it would cost more to get the sand to the railway than it would to have sand delivered on the sites. The area was eventually sold at a loss, including interest, of £1,200.

In Victoria a leasehold area at South Melbourne, which had been previously occupied as a timber yard, was taken over as a store depôt. Portion of an area of building land at Highfield-road, Camberwell, was also utilized for a timber depôt and a motor garage.

In Queensland the Deputy Commissioner took over the lease of the timber yard and stores of the Queensland Pine Company, in South Brisbane, for his principal depôt, whilst depôts were established at Cairns, Rockhampton, and other centres during building operations.

In Western Australia depôts were established at Carlisle, Maylands, Mount Hawthorn,

The tile-manufacturing machinery referred to in the following statements consisted of twelve tile-making plants, purchased by the Controller of Supplies about the same time when negotiations were being conducted for extensive contracts for the supply of tiles by private concerns. These plants were erected in New South Wales, Victoria, and Tasmania. Their product was, however, not a stock pattern tile, and, in consequence, replacements and repairs to roofs built with them will be expensive. They were subsequently sold for what they would bring.

.8

Although the depôts were generally centrally situated for their purpose when building activities were in full swing, they were certainly not convenient centres for sales when the disposal of their contents had to be undertaken. Moreover, in those cases where the Commission held the freehold, and had erected buildings thereon, difficulty was experienced in finding purchasers for them at anything like reasonable prices. In some instances auction sales were held, and depôt buildings and plant were sold without reserve.

The following statement shows the position with regard to depôts and plant as at 30th June last:—

		NEW SOT	th Walks,			Vict	DRIA.	
	Value taken over.	Sales.	Loss.	On hand.	Value taken over.	Sales.	Loù.	On hand.
Depôt Buildings	£ 15,999 (including land)	£. 8,857	£ 5,847	£ 1,295	£ 7,676	£ 90	£ 332	£ 7,254
Motor Transport Depôt Plant and	12,312	5,210	7,102		4,458	1,333	2,550	575
Sundries Tile Manufacturing	646	243	402	1	4,772	4,448	176	148
Works	657	92	565	••	988	233	755	•
	29,614	14,402	13,916	1,296	17,894	6,104	3,813	7,977

	QUEENSLAND,					Western Australia.				TASMANIA.		
	Value taken over.	Sales.	Loss.	On hand.	Value taken over.	Sales.	Loss.	On hand.	Value taken over.	Bales.	Loss.	On hand,
Depôt Buildings	£ 343 (includ- tram-	£ 163	£ 180	£	£ 1,908	£ 75	£ 376	£ 1,457	£ 826	£ 28	£ 28	£ 770
Motor Transport Depôt Plant and	ways) 6,051	2,657	734	2,660	4,385	2,735	1,463	187	966	504	462	***
Sundries Tile Manufacturing	1,110	276	74	760	1,993	1,232	618	143	204	166	17	21
Works		••	• ••		••	***		٠٠.	245	. 125	. 120 .	
	7,504	3,096	988	3,420	8,286	4,042	2,457	1,787	2,241	823	627	791

The position concerning depôts and plant, as at 30th June, 1923, may be summarized as under:—

	New South Walcs.	Victoria.	Queensland.	Western Australia,	Tasmania.	Common wealth.
Value taken on charge by Board Sales	£ 29,614 14,402	£ 17,894 6,104	£ 7,504 3,096	£ .8,286 4,042	£ 2,241 823	£ 65,539 28,467
Value remaining	15,212 1,296	11;790 7,977	4,408 3,420	4,244 1,787	1,418 791	37,072 15,271
Loss on Sales	13,916	3,813	988	2,457	627	21,801

EXPENSES.

On their creation, the Disposal Boards took over such staff as the Commissioner had employed in connexion with the depôts, and the salaries of such officers and other expenses in unred in disposing of material, including costs of advertising, auction sales, selling commission, &c., were charged against the receipts from the sales.

For their services on the Disposal Boards, General McCay and Messrs. Harrison and Midson were remunerated at the rate of £2,000 per annum, and the officers of the Commonwealth and Tasmanian Works Departments received honorariums, viz., Mr. E. E. S. Smith, £350, Mr. T. Hill, £250; Mr. Oakeshott, £150; and Mr. Bucirde, £50. In Western Australia payment for members of the Boards was fixed at the rate of £3 3s. for each sitting; but in the case of Mr. Hardwick, as a State official, the amount for his services had to be paid to the State Treasury.

The following statement shows the amounts of expenses incurred under the different headings in the various States, in relation to the sales effected, together with the percentage of expenses to sales. The figures are set out in two periods, viz., from November, 1921, to 30th June, 1922, during which time the Disposal Boards operated, and from 1st July, 1922, to 30th June, 1923, when the work was conducted by the Acting Commissioner. In comparing the actual results for the two periods it has to be borne in mind that at the outset of the sales there was a larger and more varied assortment of goods upon which to operate than in the later stages. The high amount for railage, &c., in Queensland is explained by the fact that for some time the timber from the Queensland Pine Company's current contract was stacked at Yarraman; on the termination of the contract nearly 2,000,000 super. feet of pine had to be brought to Brisbane.

	New South Wales,	Victoria.	Queensland,	Western Australia.	Tasmania.	Commonwealth.
Sales to 30th June, 1922 Sales during 1922-23	£ 72,859 91,133	£ 144,281 66,608	£ 132,834 156,158	£ 11,779 · 23,559	£ 7,642 1,780	£ 369,395 339,238
Total	163,992	210,889	288,992	35,338	9,422	708,633
Expenses to 30th June, 1922 Expenses during 1922-23	11,408 9,302	11,306 10,910	16,562 34,252	2,296 4,478	903 173	42,475 59,115
Total	20,710	22,216	50,814	6,774	1,076	101,590
Percentage of Expenses to Sales— To 30th June, 1922 During 1922-23 For full period	% 15·65 10·27 12·64	7·82 16·03 10·44	% 12·47 21·93 17·58	% 19*48 19*01 19*17	% 11·8 9·72 11·4	% 11·49 17·42 14·34
Details of Expenses— Salaries and Expenses of Board	£	£	£	£	£	£
and Staff Depôt Wages and Salaries Depôt General Expenses	8,210 · 7,492 2,434	6,323 6,610 3,526	5,072 19,596 3,686	1,932 2,092 763	496 380 129	22,033 36,180 10,538
Selling Commission and Expenses	2,213	4,884	6,548	1,987		15,632
Miscellaneous (including Rail- age, Shipping, and Rents)	361	863	15,912		71	17,207
Total	20,710	22,216	50,814	6,774	1,076	101,590

STOCKS ON HAND.

The principal stocks on hand at the commencement of the current financial year comprise hardwood in Victoria, delivered under the contract with Messr. R. Driver and Co., which is still the subject of litigation; pine in Queensland, received under the contract with the Queensland Pine.Company; and jarrali in Western Australia, purchased from the Wheat Board. The hardwood in Victoria is now being brought from Beech Forest and Orbost to Melbourne for disposal. It is anticipated that the loss on the sale of this timber will be heavy.

TERMINATION OF CONTRACTS.

One of the problems associated with the change of policy was the question of contracts and arrangements for supplies of various building materials entered into by the Commissioner. The work of investigating these contracts, negotiating with the contractors, and advising the Minister concerning the action advisable in each instance, was conducted by the Business Adviser. Varying results were achieved by this means. In some instances the contracts were terminated, but in many cases contractors refused to release the Commission, which had then either to accept deliveries or pay compensation. The following statement shows the amounts which, up to the present, have been paid by the Commission in respect of contracts terminated:—

Name.	Amount Pald by Commission.	Goods and Renzerks.
NEW SOUTH WALES.	£ s. d.	•
Miller Bros	25 0 0	Laundry tubs
Digger Cement Co	25 0 0	Laundry tubs
Beattie, W. H.	225 0 0	Cement columns
Broomfields Ltd	810 0 0 5,000 0 0	Mortice lock sets
Capper and Nonnus	5,000 0 0 9,793 3 6	Plaster sheets, &c. Cement. Claim for £10,000, less £206 10s. 6d. for cement bage
Gray and Askew	3,133 0 0	not returned
A. and E. Ellis Ltd	1,200 0 0	Joinery. This amount has been paid into Court as settlement of the claim for the sum of £25,000 in respect of an alleged breach of contract for the supply of joinery. This case is now the subject of litigation.
Harris and Turner	700 0 0	Installation of electric light
State Saw-mills	1,632 11 0	. Timber
Victoria.		
Alkemade Bros	5,000 0 0	Lime
Melbourne Fibrous Plaster Co Kemp Bros	4,200 0 0 6,999 17 9	Plaster sheets Roofing tiles, &c. The Commission also agreed to pay the sum of £900 16s. 11d. owing by the contractors upon plant
Mould, T. S	137 10 0	purchased for the purpose of the original agreement. "Domus" fires
Stuccoid Plastic Art Co	804 5 0	Plaster sheets
Lottoid Pty. Ltd	75 0 0	Ventilators
Louis Anderson and Co	900 0 0	Stoves and coppers. This amount also covers the cancellation of contracts for the supply of these goods in Tasmania and Western Australia.
Limb, Scurry, and Limb B. C. Brett, agent for D. Brims and Sons Ltd., Brisbane	9,000 0 0 150 0 0	Plaster Three-ply wood
Guvett and Sons	35 0 0	House construction
Junction Joinery and Timber Mills Pty. Ltd. (formerly E. A. and D. Green)	87,566 9 10	Joinery. The Arbitrator awarded the company the sum of £100,534 15s. 4d., and to the Commission the sum of £12,968 5s. 6d., leaving a balance of £87,566 9s. 10d.
R. Driver and Co	10,000 0 0	Hardwood. The total awarded by the Arbitrators was £121,831 14s, 8d., which was to be reduced by the amount of £60,833 19s. 1d. owing on the mills. The Commission is disputing this award. The sum of £10,000 represents sums paid to Mr. Driver, which are deductible from the amount of any award made in his favour.
QUEENSLAND.		or any avaite mate in his lavour.
Coonan, G. F	21 13 0	Wood-preserving oil
Western Australia. Yates, P.	1,000 0 0	Erection of houses
Wunderlich Ltd.	2,045 12 6	Tiles
Briggs, T. J	275 0 0	Lime, stone, and cow hair
TASMANIA. Willing, A. E	75 0 0	Shingles and palings
Chesterman and Co	330 0 0	Timber
Crisp and Gunn	59 8 1	Bricks
Batt, G. W	900 0 0	Joinery
Total	148,985 10 8	1,

		£			
New South Wales		 UMMARY.	 		19,411
Victoria		 	 		124,868
Queensland		 	 		22
Western Australia	'	 	 		3,321
Tasmania		 ••	 		1,364
Total	• •	 ***	 	• •	148,986

In addition to the above, the following cases are pending:-

Deans Ltd., Newcastle, New South Wales, who have issued a writ for the sum of £26,500 in respect of an alleged breach of an alleged verbal contract for the supply of bricks to the Commission.

Messrs. Klesey Bros., of Western Australia, have issued a writ for the sum of £713 lis. &d. damages for breach of an alleged contract for the supply of stone to the Commission.

OTHER ASSETS.

Other assets of the Commission, which might be realized, are:

(a) Building land.
(b) Unallotted houses.

(a) Building Land.

As indicated in the various Reports concerning the War Service Homes Commission presented to Parliament by the Joint Committee of Public Accounts during 1921 and 1922 (Parliamentary Papers Nos. 121, 149, 151, and 164 of 1920-21, and Nos. 11 and 32 of 1922), the acquisition of land by the Commission proceeded far ahead of possible requirements. The consequence is, that at the present time the Commission holds, in all States, except South Australia, extensive areas of land which are not being utilized, and which may not be required for War Service Homes purposes for many years, if at all. The Acting Commissioner recently invited waiting applicants to select blocks of land on areas held by the Commission, but the response was disappointing.

The number of allotments which the Commission has at present available is 8,524, the purchase price of which amounted to approximately £412,000 to which must be added interest totalling nearly £41,000. In Victoria and Western Australia, where constructional work is being carried out for the Commission by the State Savings Bank and the Workers' Homes Board respectively, available lots are being passed to those organizations for allocation to applicants. Attention is now being given by the Acting Commissioner to the question of the sale of such land as it is considered will not be required for War Service Homes purposes, having regard to the number of applications in hand for the particular localities, and the number likely to be

Evidence shows that present land values generally may be regarded as likely to hold for some time, and even to increase slightly in the future.

(b) UNALLOTTED HOUSES.

Owing principally to the erection of group houses in localities not favoured by applicants, a number of houses have remained unallotted. The number of such houses varies from time to time, but at the close of the last financial year 204 houses, representing a cost to the Commission of £150,403, were unallotted. These houses were distributed as under:—

State.	No.	No. Localities.		Remarks.	Cost	
New South Wales	34	Adamstown Bankstown Belmore Glen Innes Goulburn Kurri Kurri Lideombe Mayfield Newcastie	1 6 4 5 5 1 1 1 1 1 1	5 houses occupied on tenancy basis I house occupied on tenancy basis S houses occupied on tenancy basis liouses occupied on tenancy basis Cocupied on tenancy basis		£
		Parramatta Regent's Park Waratah	1	2 houses occupied on tenancy basis 1 house occupied on tenancy basis		

(b) continued

State.	No.	Localities.	Remarks,	Cost.
Victoria	9 *	Wonthaggi	Early is-allotment expected Pending re-allotment Pending re-allotment Pending disposal Applicant proposes to discharge liability Pending re-allotment Pending re-allotment Pending disposal. Occupied on tenancy basis	6,750
Queensland	62	Banyo	2 houses occupied on tenancy basis 1 house occupied on tenancy basis 2 houses occupied on tenancy basis Occupied on tenancy basis 1 house occupied on tenancy basis 2 houses under offer to applicants 8 houses occupied on tenancy basis 2 houses under offer to applicants 8 houses occupied on tenancy basis 2 houses occupied on tenancy basis 3 houses occupied on tenancy basis 4 houses occupied on tenancy basis 6 houses occupied on tenancy basis 1 house occupied on tenancy basis 1 house occupied on tenancy basis	43,741
Tasmania	-21	Glenorchy	Occupied on tenancy basis Occupied on tenancy basis Applied for by applicant. Not yet allotted Occupied on yearly lease Under offer	13,072
Western Australia	78	West Subiaco 28 Victoria Park 13 Mt. Hawthorn 3 Osborne Park 7 North Perth 8 East Premante 6 Cannington 2 Kalamunda 1 Collie 2 Bassendean 3 Leederville 3 Bayswater 1 78		58,064

^{*}Since this return was compiled all the houses in Victoria, except one each at Altona and Terang, have been sold.

Efforts are being made by the Commission to sell these houses under the powers conferred by section 48 of the War Service Homes Act, which provides that the Commissioner may dispose of such property as is not required for the purposes of the Act.

Offers for available houses have been invited through the press—preference being given to returned soldiers and other eligibles who receive the benefits of the provisions of the War Service Homes Act. In the event of no offer being received from an eligible person within one month, other offers are considered—the terms being 10 per cent. deposit, the balance over a period of five years, at 6 per cent. interest.

COMMITTEE'S OBSERVATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.

The realization of the assets of the War Service Homes Commission, necessitated solely by the drastic change of Government policy, has not yet reached finality, and still further losses must be expected.

The Queensland timber properties and mills, which gave promise of substantial savings in the execution of the scheme, are still idle. Offers concerning them have been received, but have not been sufficiently tempting to induce the Government to operate the mills or to dispose of the properties. The necessity for retaining them for their original purpose has long since ceased to exist, but, in view of the rapidly diminishing areas of hoop pine country in Queensland, the Committee is of opinion that, so far as the freehold timber-bearing areas of these properties are concerned, the Government would be well advised to refrain from sacrificing an asset which must undoubtedly appreciate in value.

At the outset the Commissioner embarked on an ambitious building programme without taking into consideration the amount of labour and material available. Though the bulk of the purchases of material were made at some saving on the prevailing market rates, prices were then on the crest of a wave, and a fall was imminent. Unless the material could be quickly absorbed in constructional work loss was inevitable. With the change of policy it became necessary to dispose of the accumulated stocks. But meanwhile the market had fallen rapidly and the Commission, in common with all other sellers, had to face heavy losses. It was admitted, however, that the loss sustained by the Commission was greatly increased, particularly so, as far as timber stocks were concerned, by reason of faulty stacking and lack of care.

The expenses incurred in the disposal work appear to the Committee to be out of all proportion to the results achieved, and the Committee considers the creation of a separate and expensive organization to have been quite unnecessary. It is of opinion that better results would have been secured, and the losses lessened, by utilization of material on constructional work.

The Committee recommends that, after a careful study of probable future requirements for War Service Homes purposes, such areas of land as are not likely to be required should be gradually and judiciously placed on the market. Large areas should be subdivided, and a limited number of allotments in a district offered for sale by auction over a period of eighteen months or two years. The terms should be sufficiently liberal to enable artisans and others of limited means-to acquire a block for the ultimate erection of their own homes. To offer large areas for sale would merely encourage land speculation.

As interest has to be paid on the capital cost of unallotted houses, the action taken to dispose of such houses commends itself to the Committee. With the present house shortage in Australia, the fact that the Commission has so many of these houses on hand, is a grave reflection on the judgment of those responsible for their erection.

Office of the Joint Committee of Public Accounts, Federal Parliament House, Melbourne, 22nd August, 1923.